Office of Inspector General

FLHSMV — FLORIDA HIGHWAY SAFETY AND MOTOR VEHICLES

On-Call Program Audit
Audit Report 201920-01

February 25, 2020

Executive Summary

The Department of Highway Safety and Motor Vehicles' (Department) operations require support 24-hours a day, 7-days a week to ensure there are no interruptions to Department services. The Department's On-Call program aims to have members available to support Department operations and ensure there are no interruptions to Department services. The Department and other state agencies are authorized to grant pay additives, including On-Call, in accordance with the annual Florida General Appropriations Act as authorized by existing agency resources consistent with provisions of Sections 110.2035 and 216.251, Florida Statutes (F.S.), the applicable rules of Department of Management Services (DMS) and negotiated collective bargaining agreements. On-Call is a pay additive that compensates Department members for being available to work during normal non-working hours.

The purpose of this audit was to evaluate the Department's On-Call program efficiency and compliance with applicable laws, Department policy, and procedure. We reviewed applicable documentation including On-Call authorizations, On-Call and Call-Back practices and procedures, a sample of members' People First timesheets, and interviewed Department members involved in approving and processing On-Call requests.

Our review determined evaluating On-Call staffing requirements would improve allocation of Department resources. We recommend Division of Administrative Services' (DAS) and Information Systems Administration's (ISA) management review and evaluate On-Call staffing needs to determine whether the current On-Call staffing levels are necessary and an appropriate use of Department resources. We also recommend DAS, ISA, and Florida Highway Patrol (FHP) coordinate with the Bureau of Personnel Services (BPS) to implement a process to periodically review and evaluate On-Call staffing levels to determine if they are appropriate and necessary. We further recommend DAS review and update division-specific On-Call procedures.

Our review also determined oversight of On-Call and Call-Back time claimed could be improved through stronger supervisory review of timesheets and proper documentation of Call-Back hours worked. We recommend division management ensure supervisors review timesheets with On-Call and Call-Back pay additives prior to approval in accordance with Department policy. We also recommend FHP formally communicate to members the expectations for documenting Call-Back hours worked. We further recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP, in coordination with the Learning and Development

Office (LDO), provide training on On-Call and Call-Back requirements and procedures, including requirements for documenting On-Call and Call-Back hours worked.

Our review further determined On-Call pay additives for non-sworn[1] members should be supported with required approval documentation. We recommend BPS ensure On-Call requests for non-sworn members are supported with required Personnel Action Review (PAR) documentation prior to approval in People First.

Background and Introduction

Pay additives are temporary increases to a career service member's pay based on temporary conditions. These temporary conditions can range from extra duties to working during normal non-work hours. On-Call is a pay additive that compensates Department members for being available to work during normal non-working hours. State agencies are authorized to grant additives in accordance with the annual Florida General Appropriations Act as authorized by existing agency resources consistent with provisions of Sections 110.2035 and 216.251, F.S., the applicable rules of DMS, and negotiated collective bargaining agreements.

The Department's On-Call program is designed to have members available after normal working hours to support Department operations and ensure there are no interruptions to Department services. The chart below shows the On-Call and Call-Back time claimed by Department sworn[2] and non-sworn members during the 2018-19 Fiscal Year.

Member Type	On-Call Hours Claimed	Call-Back Hours Claimed	Total
Sworn	277,167.5	4,899.75	282,067.25
Non-Sworn	83,556	232.75	83,788.75
Total	**360,723.5**	**5,132.5**	**365,856**

Rule 60L-32.0012, Florida Administrative Code (F.A.C.), explains agencies may approve members to be placed On-Call. Members placed On-Call shall be compensated in accordance with applicable collective bargaining agreements. If called back to work, then members shall continue to be compensated for the On-Call additive in addition to any hours the member is compensated for Call-Back hours worked. Members must have been instructed by management to remain available during off

---

[1] Non-Sworn members do not have arrest power, authority to carry a gun, nor do they take an oath.
[2] Sworn members are law enforcement officers who have taken an oath to support the constitution of the United States, their state, and the laws of their agency's jurisdiction.

duty, leave word of where they can be reached, and be able to perform assigned duties on a short notice.

The Florida Collective Bargaining Agreement for 2017-2020 defines the On-Call compensation amounts for non-sworn members. Members who are required to be On-Call shall be paid $1 per hour Monday through Friday, while members required to be On-Call on Saturday, Sunday, or a holiday shall be paid an additive in an amount per hour equal to one-fourth of the statewide hourly minimum for the member's pay grade per hour. If a member is On-Call and called back to work, then the member will be credited for actual time worked, or a minimum of two hours, whichever is greater.

The Florida Collective Bargaining Agreement with the Florida Police Benevolent Association for 2017-2020 defines the On-Call compensation amounts for sworn members. Members who are required to be On-Call shall be paid $1 per hour Monday through Friday, while members required to be On-Call on Saturday, Sunday, or a holiday shall be paid an additive in an amount equal to one-fourth of the statewide hourly minimum for the member's pay grade per hour. A member called back to work when they are not on-duty will be credited for actual time worked or a minimum of four hours, whichever is greater.

Additive Request and Approval Process

Department Policy 5.11, *Pay Policy and Personnel Actions*, requires all personnel actions to be reviewed and properly authorized prior to implementation in accordance with all applicable laws, rules, and policies, and administered in an equitable and non-discriminatory manner. The Department's *Procedures for Pay and Personnel Actions* manual requires additives be reviewed for budget impact and pay equity by the Office of Financial Management and the BPS before authorization. Accordingly, pay additives are requested via a Personnel Action Request (PAR) and a Classification and Compensation Review (CCR) form. These forms are completed by bureau management or a division liaison and submitted through the member's chain of command along with a justification for the requested additive.

Once approved by the member's division, it is submitted to the BPS's Office of Workforce Efficiency (OWE). OWE reviews the request, forms, additive rate, and justification. OWE submits it to the Office of Financial Management for budget review. Once approved by the Office of Financial Management, BPS, and Executive Director or designee, an effective date is obtained, if needed. The request is submitted to Benefits and Member Services within BPS. A Benefits and Member Services consultant reviews the PAR data and enters it into People First which enables a member to document On-Call and Call-Back time on their timesheet.

On-Call and Call-Back Procedures by Division

DAS, ISA, and FHP have authorized positions that can claim On-Call. Each division has its own policy and procedure for claiming On-Call and Call-Back:

Division of Administrative Services

DAS has an On-Call procedure which details how members are assigned to On-Call, how they can be called back, and how they document time worked during Call-Back work. DAS has assigned positions which are considered On-Call positions within the maintenance and security areas. These On-Call positions are available on weekends and after hours and have a seven-day rotation. If necessary, the supervisor contacts the On-Call individual when there is a maintenance or security issue such as a fire, electrical outage, or security alarm panel failure affecting the Neil Kirkman building. Members who work Call-Back are required to document all related incident information on the Incident Log located in the Maintenance Office. Members are also required to email or deliver a written follow-up After Action Report to the first level chain of command within 72 hours of incident. This supporting documentation is used to validate members' timesheets.

Information Systems Administration

ISA has positions which are authorized for On-Call assigned to the various sections of ISA. These On-Call positions are available on weekends and after hours and have a seven-day rotation. When support is needed, Department members will submit a request for service via the Technical Assistance Center (TAC). This request creates a ticket with information pertaining to the requested service, who requested the service, and date and time of the request. This request is received by the members working On-Call. The ISA member will use this ticket to track their work and the service request's status. Supervisors use this ticket and supporting documentation to validate members' timesheets claiming Call-Back time worked.

Florida Highway Patrol

FHP has various sections, including: the Bureau of Field Operations, Bureau of Criminal Investigations and Intelligence (BCII), Traffic Homicide Investigations (THI), and Commercial Vehicle Enforcement (CVE) which utilize On-Call assignments in various ways. Each group has different methods of assigning members to On-Call and documenting Call-Back time worked. All FHP sworn members are authorized to work On-Call, while non-sworn members' chain of command must submit a PAR requesting On-Call authorization. Additionally, in emergency situations, sworn members may be called back to active duty at a time not contiguous with the members' scheduled hours

to work. In these situations, members will be required to report back to duty and to carry out duties assigned by supervisors.

FHP Policy 13.05, *Report of Daily Activity* requires sworn members to log on-duty by radio or with their assigned Mobile Data Computer (MDC) via the Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD). While on-duty, members should ensure that unit activity changes and incident assignments are made in CAD utilizing the MDC or by calling information into the Regional Communication Center (RCC) by radio. Sworn members should monitor information on the MDC to ensure it is entered accurately into the CAD when it is called in by radio to the RCC. Supervisors use this information to validate members' timesheets.

Findings and Recommendations

Overall, our review determined the On-Call program is adequate; however, we noted the following areas in which improvements could be implemented.

On-Call Staffing

Finding No. 1: Evaluating On-Call staffing requirements would improve allocation of Department resources.

Best practices from Atlassian Incident Management's *A Better Approach to On-Call Scheduling* explains companies have different needs and they should evaluate those needs prior to creating an On-Call schedule. Additionally, management should check-in regularly after creating an On-Call schedule to determine if it is working for the team, helping prevent and resolve issues, and is effective for both the customer and On-Call member. The process does not have to be static.

We reviewed sworn and non-sworn positions which have On-Call approval and had at least one member in that position who claimed On-Call and Call-Back during the 2018-19 Fiscal Year.

Our review determined the number of members claiming On-Call appeared disproportionate to the number of members being called back for certain positions as identified in Exhibit 1. Through interviews with division managers, we learned none of the divisions have a process to assess the business need or approved positions eligible for On-Call status. Further, none of the divisions complete a periodic review of the On-Call process to determine whether business objectives are being achieved effectively by placing members On-Call.

Exhibit 1 below is a sample comparing the number of members per position who were eligible to claim On-Call, claimed On-Call hours, and claimed Call-Back hours for the 2018-19 Fiscal Year.

Exhibit 1:

Division	Bureau	Position Title	Positions	Vacancies	Claiming On-Call	Claiming Call-back
DAS	Office Services	Maintenance Mechanic	5	0	3	1
DAS Total			**5**	**0**	**3**	**1**
FHP	BCII	Government Operations Consultant II	6	1	4	0
FHP	BCII	Government Operations Consultant III	3	1	2	1
FHP	BCII	Operations Review Specialist	4	0	4	0
FHP	Training Academy	FHP Sergeant	6	1	1	1
FHP	Bureau of Patrol Operations - Troop L	FHP Trooper	109	17	1	0
FHP Total			**128**	**20**	**12**	**2**
ISA	Enterprise Database Services	Database Consultant	1	0	1	0
ISA	Enterprise Database Services	Senior Database Analyst	8	1	7	0
ISA	Service Development	Application Systems Programmer I	4	2	1	0
ISA	Service Development	Application Systems Programmer II	9	2	3	0
ISA	Service Development	Application Systems Programmer III	17	1	9	6
ISA	Service Development	Computer Programmer Analyst	1	0	1	1
ISA	Service Operations	Office Automation Analyst	4	0	1	1
ISA	Service Operations	Systems Programmer I	3	0	3	0
ISA	Service Operations	Systems Programmer II	12	4	3	2
ISA	Service Operations	Systems Programmer III	12	1	10	4
ISA	Service Operations	Telecommunications Specialist III	4	0	1	0
ISA Total			**75**	**11**	**40**	**14**
Total			**208**	**31**	**55**	**17**

Exhibit 2 below is a sample comparing On-Call and Call-Back hours claimed by each eligible position for the 2018-19 Fiscal Year.

Exhibit 2:

Division	Bureau	Position Title	On-Call Hours Claimed	Call Back-Hours Claimed
DAS	Office Services	Maintenance Mechanic	5,660.00	17.00
DAS Total			**5,660.00**	**17.00**
FHP	BCII	Government Operations Consultant II	2,091.25	0.00
FHP	BCII	Government Operations Consultant III	1,841.00	2.00
FHP	BCII	Operations Review Specialist	1,982.00	0.00
FHP	Training Academy	FHP Sergeant	1,906.00	22.00
FHP	Bureau of Patrol Operations - Troop L	FHP Trooper	1,088.50	0.00
FHP Total			**8,908.75**	**24.00**
ISA	Enterprise Database Services	Database Consultant	123.00	0.00
ISA	Enterprise Database Services	Senior Database Analyst	10,712.00	0.00
ISA	Service Development	Application Systems Programmer I	2,452.00	0.00
ISA	Service Development	Application Systems Programmer II	2,264.25	0.00
ISA	Service Development	Application Systems Programmer III	20,066.00	46.75
ISA	Service Development	Computer Programmer Analyst	1,164.00	2.00
ISA	Service Operations	Office Automation Analyst	1,455.50	55.50
ISA	Service Operations	Systems Programmer I	2,035.25	0.00
ISA	Service Operations	Systems Programmer II	5,562.00	28.50
ISA	Service Operations	Systems Programmer III	21,478.75	20.50
ISA	Service Operations	Telecommunications Specialist III	937.50	0.00
ISA Total			**68,250.25**	**153.25**
Total			**82,819.00**	**194.25**

Additionally, during interviews with DAS and FHP management, we noted there was limited oversight coupled with a general lack of knowledge about which positions/employees were authorized to be On-Call. We also reviewed Department and division-specific On-Call policies and procedures and determined DAS's procedure was last updated in 2014 and included outdated information.

Recommendations

We recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP management review and evaluate On-Call staffing needs and determine whether the current On-Call staffing levels are necessary and an appropriate use of Department resources.

We also recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP coordinate with BPS to implement a process to periodically review and evaluate On-Call staffing levels to determine if they are appropriate and necessary.

We additionally recommend DAS review and update division specific On-Call procedures.

Management Response

BPS will provide each division with a quarterly report of individuals who claimed On-Call on their timesheets. This report will also contain information as to whether the employee was called back to work during the time they claimed On-Call. This will allow the divisions to evaluate their On-Call staffing levels.

Based on OIG audit recommendations FHP reviewed On-Call assignments of members who claimed any On-Call hours during the 2018-19 Fiscal Year. FHP determined that all members assigned On-Call during this period were appropriate and necessary. A random review of members' timesheets also determined members were generally properly documenting On-Call hours claimed. A few minor discrepancies were identified (e.g. properly coding call-back) and have been addressed with troop command. As provided in Finding 2, FHP is coordinating with BPS and LDO to develop web-based training to enhance member knowledge for proper documentation and review of timesheets.

In addition, BPS will work with DAS leadership to update their divisions on-call procedures.

Supervisory Review

Finding No. 2: Oversight of On-Call and Call-Back time claimed could be improved through stronger supervisory review of timesheets and proper documentation of Call-Back hours worked.

The Department's *Attendance and Leave Procedures for DHSMV Members* requires members to maintain and promptly submit an accurate record of all hours worked and leave used on their People First timesheet. Supervisors are required to approve

included members' timesheets weekly and excluded members' timesheets monthly within five calendar days after the end of the work period. Supervisors are required to verify and approve a member's hours worked, authorize leave requests, and ensure compliance with the Fair Labor Standards Act regarding overtime.

ISA *Employee On-Call Procedures* and DAS *On-Call Procedures* require members to document Call-Back hours worked and specifies that supervisors are to review appropriate supporting documentation prior to approving the timesheet. Additionally, FHP Policy 13.05, *Report of Daily Activity*, requires members to log on-duty by radio or with their assigned MDC via CAD. Members should monitor information on the MDC to ensure it is entered accurately into the CAD when it is called in by radio.

We reviewed a sample of members' People First timesheets to determine if they used On-Call/Call-Back codes appropriately and whether they were authorized to receive On-Call/Call-Back pay. Our review of 40 members timesheets noted the following 10 issues:

- 1 sworn member claimed 12 hours of On-Call on the same day they claimed 18 hours of regular work;
- 2 non-sworn members claimed Call-Back hours on their timesheets, but they were not authorized to claim On-Call; therefore, they were not authorized to claim Call-Back;
- 1 non-sworn member claimed Call-Back time on their timesheet but did not claim On-Call for the same day as their Call-Back time; and
- 6 non-sworn members did not claim On-Call time for hours they claimed Call-Back.

Additionally, we reviewed a sample of members to determine if Call-Back time recorded and approved on their timesheet was supported with Call-Back documentation according to division-specific requirements. Our review of 40 members' timesheets and division-specific tracking systems noted the following:

- 3 FHP sworn members did not log their Call-Back hours in CAD system; and
- 1 FHP non-sworn member did not have supporting documentation for Call-Back time claimed on their timesheet.

Recommendations

We recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP management ensure supervisors review timesheets with On-Call and Call-Back pay additives prior to approval in accordance with Department Policy.

We also recommend FHP formally communicate to members the expectations for documenting Call-Back hours worked in CAD.

We further recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP, in coordination with LDO, provide training related to On-Call and Call-Back requirements and procedures, including requirements for documenting On-Call and Call-Back hours worked.

Management Response

BPS will work with each division to develop procedures and instructions for the entry and approval of on-call time submitted.

Once these are developed, we will work with LDO to create and distribute a training for all members assigned to On-Call and all supervisors.

On-Call Authorization Documentation

Finding No. 3: On-Call pay additives for non-sworn members should be supported with required approval documentation.

The Department's *Procedures for Pay and Personnel Actions* manual defines the request and approval process for personnel actions including pay additives. Requests are completed on a PAR Form and submitted with supporting documents to BPS. The PAR Form and supporting documentation are reviewed by BPS for accuracy, completeness, and compliance with applicable statutes, rules, and policies. Personnel actions are not effective without a properly completed and authorized PAR Form.

During our review of 25 non-sworn members receiving On-Call and Call-Back pay, we determined 3 members did not have On-Call approval documented on a PAR:

- 2 members did not have On-Call authorized on their PAR but were authorized in People First; and
- 1 member did not have On-Call authorized on their PAR, but On-Call authorization was documented on a CCR Form.

Recommendations

We recommend the Bureau of Personnel Services ensure On-Call requests for non-sworn members are supported with required PAR documentation prior to approval in People First.

Management Response

BPS will work with FHP leadership to develop a process for ensuring all FHP members claiming On-Call were actually assigned to On-Call.

Purpose, Scope, and Methodology

The objective of this audit was to evaluate the Department's On-Call program's efficiency and compliance with applicable laws, Department policy, and procedure.

The scope of this audit included all Department On-Call documentation for the 2018-19 Fiscal Year.

The methodology included:

- Reviewing applicable Florida Statutes and Administrative Code;
- Reviewing applicable Department policies and procedures;
- Reviewing applicable collective bargaining agreements;
- Reviewing documentation applicable to approving On-Call authorizations;
- Reviewing On-Call and Call-Back practices and procedures to determine efficiency, effectiveness, and compliance with policies and procedures;
- Reviewing a sample of members' People First timesheets; and
- Interviewing Department personnel involved in approving and processing On-Call requests.

Distribution, Statement of Accordance, and Project Team

Distribution

Terry L. Rhodes, Executive Director
Jennifer Langston, Chief of Staff
Susan Carey, Director of Finance
Col. Gene Spaulding, Director of the Florida Highway Patrol
Lt. Col. Troy Thompson, Deputy Director of the Florida Highway Patrol
Boyd Dickerson-Walden, Chief Information Officer
Kevin Bailey, Director of Administrative Services
Terry Stepp, Chief Personnel Services

Melinda M. Miguel, Chief Inspector General
Sherrill F. Norman, Auditor General

Statement of Accordance

Section 20.055, Florida Statutes, requires the Florida Department of Highway Safety and Motor Vehicles' Inspector General to review, evaluate, and report on policies, plans, procedures, accounting, financial, and other operations of the Department and to recommend improvements. This audit engagement was conducted in accordance with applicable *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing* published by the Institute of Internal Auditors and *Principles and Standards for Offices of Inspector General* published by the Association of Inspectors General.

Project Team

Engagement conducted by:
Sean Shrader, Auditor
Kim Butler, Auditor

Under the supervision of:
Erin Mook, Acting Audit Director

Approved by:

Mike Stacy, Acting Inspector General

ATTACHMENT - Management Response

FLHSMV
FLORIDA HIGHWAY SAFETY AND MOTOR VEHICLES

Terry L. Rhodes
Executive Director

2900 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0500
www.flhsmv.gov

MEMORANDUM

DATE: February 25, 2020
TO: Erin Mook, Acting Audit Director
FROM: Terry Stepp, Chief of Personnel Services
SUBJECT: Management Response to the Department On-Call Program Audit
            (201920-01)

The following is our response to the findings and recommendations presented in the report.

Finding 1 - *On-Call Staffing*

Evaluating On-Call staffing requirements would improve allocation of Department resources.

Recommendations

We recommend DAS, ISA and FHP management review and evaluate On-Call staffing needs and determine whether the current On-Call staffing levels are necessary and an appropriate use of Department resources.

We also recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP coordinate with BPS to implement a process to periodically review and evaluate On-Call staffing levels to determine if appropriate and necessary.

We additionally recommend DAS review and update division specific On-Call procedures.

Management Response

The BPS will provide each division with a quarterly report of individuals who claimed on-call on their timesheets. This report will also contain information as to whether the employee was called back to work during the time they claimed on-call. This will allow the divisions to evaluate their on-call staffing levels.

Service • Integrity • Courtesy • Professionalism • Innovation • Excellence
An Equal Opportunity Employer

Based on OIG audit recommendations the Florida Highway Patrol has reviewed On-Call assignments of members who claimed any On-Call hours during the 2018-19 fiscal year period. FHP determined that all members assigned On-Call during this period were appropriate and necessary. A random review of member timesheets also determined members were generally properly documenting on-call hours claimed. A few minor discrepancies were identified (e.g. properly coding call-back) and have been addressed with troop command. As provided in Finding 2, FHP is coordinating with BPS and LDO to develop web-based training to enhance member knowledge for proper documentation and review of timesheets.

In addition, the BPS will work with DAS leadership to update their divisions on-call procedures.

Finding 2 - *Supervisory Review*

Oversight of On-Call and Call-Back time claimed could be improved through stronger supervisory review of timesheets and proper documentation of Call-Back hours worked.

Recommendations

We recommend division management ensure supervisors review timesheets with On-Call and Call-Back pay additives prior to approval in accordance with Department Policy.

We also recommend FHP formally communicate to members the expectations for documenting Call-Back hours worked in CAD.

We further recommend DAS, ISA, and FHP, in coordination with LDO, provide training on On-Call and Call-Back requirements and procedures, including requirements for documenting On-Call and Call-Back hours worked.

Management Response

The BPS will work with each division to develop procedures and instructions for the entry and approval of on-call time submitted.

Once these are developed we will work with the LDO to create and distribute a training for all members assigned to on-call and all supervisors.

Finding 3 - *On-Call Authorization Documentation*

On-Call pay additives for non-sworn members should be supported with required approval documentation.

Recommendations

We recommend the Bureau of Personnel Services ensure On-Call requests for non-sworn members are supported with required PAR documentation prior to approval in People First.

Management Response

The BPS will work with FHP leadership to develop a process for ensuring all FHP members claiming on-call were actually assigned to on-call.